



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### Choice of Scottish Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium education at the primary and secondary school stages

**Citation for published version:**

O'Hanlon, F 2015, 'Choice of Scottish Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium education at the primary and secondary school stages: Parent and pupil perspectives', *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, vol. 18, no. 2, pp. 242-259. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2014.923374>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.1080/13670050.2014.923374](https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2014.923374)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Peer reviewed version

**Published In:**

International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

© O'Hanlon, F. (2014). Choice of Scottish Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium education at the primary and secondary school stages: parent and pupil perspectives. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. 10.1080/13670050.2014.923374

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



# **Choice of Scottish Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium education at the primary and secondary school stages: parent and pupil perspectives**

Fiona O'Hanlon, *The University of Edinburgh*<sup>1</sup>

(*The International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 2014, DOI: 10.1080/13670050.2014.923374).

## **Abstract**

*Results are presented of a comparative study of the reasons for parental choice of Scottish Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium primary education in the year 2000, and of the reasons for pupils' decisions to continue with Gaelic or Welsh-medium education at secondary school in 2007. Parents in both contexts cited the quality of Celtic-medium education to similar extents in the choice of Welsh or Gaelic-medium education, but parents in the Welsh context more frequently cited employment rationales, and parents in the Scottish context more frequently cited heritage and the benefits of bilingualism. The Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupils cited a preference for learning in Welsh or Gaelic, a wish to continue to be educated with friends, heritage, quality of Celtic-medium education and employment rationales to similar extents in the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education. However, Welsh-medium pupils more frequently cited the Welsh-medium education experiences of older family members, and Gaelic-medium pupils more frequently cited valuing bilingualism as a reason for such a choice. The results are discussed in relation to previous research on choice of Gaelic and Welsh-medium education, and in relation to contextual factors, such as linguistic demographics, and the level of institutionalization of Gaelic and Welsh within each national context.*

## **Key words:**

Gaelic-medium education; Welsh-medium education; school choice; immersion education; language planning.

## **1.Introduction**

This article investigates the rationales underpinning parental choice of Welsh-medium and Scottish Gaelic-medium primary education, and additionally explores the rationales underpinning Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium primary pupils' decisions regarding the medium of instruction of their secondary schooling. Data are drawn from a sample of 63 parents and their children (40 from Wales and 23 from Scotland), interviewed in 2007. These parents made a choice for Celtic-medium education for their child in the year 2000, in the early years of political devolution following the *Government of Wales Act 1998* and the *Scotland Act 1998*. The pupils were in the final year of primary school in 2007, and had recently chosen between Celtic-medium and English-medium secondary education. The overarching theoretical framework for the investigation of such parental and pupil choice of Celtic-medium education is language maintenance, in which it is generally accepted that education plays a key role in language acquisition planning for 'threatened' languages,

---

<sup>1</sup> Fiona.O'Hanlon@ed.ac.uk

despite differing opinions on the relative prominence and longevity of such a role (for a summary, see McPake et al, forthcoming). Threatened languages are here defined, following Fishman, as ‘languages that are not replacing themselves demographically’ by means of home and community based inter-generational transmission (Fishman 1991, p.81). Jones (2009) shows this classification of ‘threatened language’ to apply to both Welsh and Scottish Gaelic. An analysis of the 2001 census data showed a maximum of 14.9% of 3 year olds in Wales, and a maximum of 0.5% of 3 year olds in Scotland to have acquired their Celtic language by means of intergenerational transmission in the home (Jones 2009, 2) - less than the 21% and 1.6% required to maintain the Welsh and Gaelic languages at overall 2001 census levels (Office for National Statistics 2001, Registrar General for Scotland 2005). The role of education in language acquisition planning for Welsh and Scottish Gaelic is emphasised in national language planning policy for the two languages. Indeed, the expansion of Celtic-medium primary education and the continuity of such pupils to Celtic-medium secondary education are identified as crucial elements of the maintenance of both languages (Welsh Assembly Government 2003, 2010; Welsh Government 2012a; Bòrd na Gàidhlig 2007, 2012).

Section 2 of the present article outlines existing research on the choice of Celtic-medium primary and secondary education in Wales and Scotland. Section 3 outlines the methodological approaches to sampling, data collection and analysis employed in the present study, and Section 4 presents the results. The article has two purposes. The first is to provide evidence that contributes to our understanding of parental and pupil choice of Celtic-medium education within each national context - that may, for example, aid policy direction for the planned expansion of pupil numbers within Celtic-medium primary and secondary education within each nation (Welsh Assembly Government 2010; Bòrd na Gàidhlig 2012). The second aim of the article is comparative: to explore the influence of socio-cultural context on decisions for minority-medium education within two devolved nations of one state (the United Kingdom) by means of a comparison of rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium education across the national contexts.

## **2. Research on the choice of Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium education**

### ***2.1. Wales***

The *Education Act 1944* in effect established the principle of parental choice of Welsh-medium education, as it determined that ‘pupils ... be educated in accordance with the wishes of their parents’ (Section 76). The first state-funded Welsh-medium primary school opened in 1947, and a further 29 had been established across 10 local authorities by 1956, the year in which the first Welsh-medium secondary school opened (Morgan 2003, 42). The initial intention was that Welsh-medium schools cater for children who had Welsh as their first

language, but by the 1960s the schools were also attended by children who had acquired Welsh as a second language at Welsh-medium nursery schools (Baker and Prys Jones 2000, 117). The parental group Undeb Rhieni Ysgolion Cymraeg (the Union of Welsh-medium school parents) framed the parental demand for Welsh-medium education in the 1950s and 1960s within a discourse that associated language with nation, and which viewed Welsh-medium education as a means to reflect and maintain a Welsh language cultural heritage in Wales (Williams and Reynolds 2003, 363). A perception that Welsh offered little opportunity for upward social mobility at this time – as found by Gittins (1967, 236) – led some to link the choice of Welsh-medium education with parents who were already middle-class (Morgan 1969, Khleif 1980).

However, the 1960s and 1970s saw a shift in the nature of the association between Welsh and social mobility, as the decentralization of aspects of the civil service and broadcasting from London to Cardiff promoted the Welsh language in high-status employment (Marshall and Alderman 1991; Williams, Roberts and Isaac 1978). The right to use Welsh in legal proceedings granted by the *Welsh Language Act 1967* similarly associated the language with the legal profession. Williams, Roberts and Isaac (1978) thus hypothesized that working-class parents might choose Welsh-medium education in order that their children gain social mobility within the new Welsh language economy. However, social mobility was not found to be a primary rationale for the choice of Welsh-medium education in either the study of working-class parents in the Rhondda Valley (South East Wales) by Williams, Roberts and Isaac or the study of working class parents in Gwent (South East Wales) by Bush, Atkinson and Read (1984). Rather, the choice of Welsh-medium education was typically associated with social and educational factors amongst these parents. Social factors included a wish that the child integrate into the cultural linguistic heritage of the family, community or nation - a rationale cited by both Welsh-speaking and non-Welsh speaking parents. Educational factors incorporated a belief that Welsh-medium education was a good-quality education (because of small class sizes, strong ethos or high educational achievement), and an awareness of the cognitive benefits of bilingualism (for example, in facilitating the acquisition of a third language). Bush, Atkinson and Read concluded that the choice of Welsh-medium education was related to a lifestyle choice - to membership of a 'status group' (Weber 1968) which values the Welsh language and culture - rather than to 'social class' or to social mobility aspirations (1984: E8).

The *Education Reform Act 1988* greatly strengthened parental rights to choose their child's school in England and Wales. A study of its effects in relation to the choice of Welsh-medium education conducted by Bellin et al. (1999) supported Bush, Atkinson and Read's conclusion that the choice related primarily to cultural, rather than socio-economic factors

(such as family social-class or a wish for social mobility). However, Bellin et al. (1999) emphasised that instrumental motivations - such as the quality of Welsh-medium education - often supplemented such cultural motivations. A similar pattern - of predominantly integrative cultural motivations, often supplemented by instrumental motivations - was found in studies of parental choice of Welsh-medium primary education conducted by Packer and Campbell (1997) in Cardiff, and by Hodges (2012) in Caerphilly (South East Wales). Cultural expressive reasons cited in these studies included a wish to integrate (or to re-integrate) into the cultural or linguistic traditions of one's family, of the community, or of the Welsh nation. For some parents, the choice of Welsh-medium education was also associated with a wish to maintain the tradition of Welsh-speaking in Wales. Instrumental reasons included a perception that Welsh-medium schools have high educational standards, a strong ethos and high levels of achievement, and a perception that pupils' career opportunities beyond school are enhanced by Welsh-medium education. Some parents also cited the benefits of bilingualism as an instrumental reason for the choice of Welsh-medium primary education.

The research on the choice of Welsh-medium primary education has focused on Anglicized areas in South East Wales, and there is little research information relating to bilingual or Welsh-speaking areas in mid- and north Wales. There is similarly little research nationally on the reasons for the choice of Welsh-medium education at the secondary school stage. Gruffudd, Meek and Stevens (2004) interviewed parents of final year Welsh-medium primary pupils on the reasons for the choice of medium of instruction of mathematics and science at the secondary school stage. They reported parents of Welsh-medium pupils in Anglicised areas to be more willing to continue with Welsh-medium secondary education, and for parents from Welsh-speaking areas to be more likely to lack confidence in their children's linguistic skills for studying secondary subjects through the medium of Welsh, or to believe primary school Welsh skills to be sufficient for their children. However, the study additionally identified the pupil as a stakeholder in decisions regarding the language of secondary education. Pupils were reported by their parents to tend to make the same choices regarding language in education as their friends.

## **2.2. Scotland**

The *Education (Scotland) Act 1945* established the 'general principle that ... pupils are to be educated in accordance with the wishes of their parents', a principle strengthened by the *Education (Scotland) Act 1981* which gave parents the right to request that their child attend a particular school. The first Gaelic-medium primary school units were established within

English-medium schools in Glasgow and Inverness in 1985. MacLeod (2003) notes such Gaelic-medium primary school provision to have been requested by parents whose children had attended the Gaelic-medium playgroups which had been established across Scotland since 1980. These playgroups accepted children from both Gaelic speaking and non-Gaelic speaking backgrounds, and thus Gaelic-medium primary education catered for both first and second language speakers of Gaelic from its inception.

Grant (1983) and Roberts (1991) give an insight into the reasons underpinning parental demand for Gaelic-medium primary education in the 1980s. Grant (1983) conducted a study of the feasibility of establishing Gaelic-medium education in Glasgow and Argyll, whilst Roberts (1991) investigated demand for Gaelic-medium primary education amongst parents of preschool pupils in the Western Isles. Both studies noted the existence of parental demand for Gaelic-medium education amongst Gaelic-speaking and non-Gaelic speaking parents, and found demand for Gaelic-medium primary education to primarily relate to social and educational, rather than economic, rationales. In Anglicized urban areas, social reasons typically related to a wish to continue a tradition of Gaelic speaking in the family, or to a wish to preserve the Gaelic language and culture in Scotland. In rural Gaelic-speaking areas, social factors often pertained to the local level, with demand for Gaelic-medium education typically deriving from a wish to reflect, or to integrate into, a community tradition of Gaelic-speaking. Educational reasons related to a parental belief that early immersion education is an effective model of bilingual education, and to a parental awareness of the benefits of bilingualism (for example in the acquisition of subsequent languages.) That Gaelic was not associated with social mobility at this time is evidenced by Roberts' (1991) report of a parental belief that English and modern foreign languages would be more important than Gaelic to their child's future employment.

Subsequent studies of parental choice of Gaelic-medium primary education, whether in traditionally Gaelic-speaking areas (MacNeil 1993; Stockdale, MacGregor and Munro 2003) or national studies (Johnstone et al. 1999; O'Hanlon, McLeod and Paterson 2010) similarly found the choice of Gaelic-medium education to relate to social or educational, rather than economic, factors. Social reasons were cited as the primary parental motivation for the choice of Gaelic-medium education in all of these studies and most often related to a desire that Gaelic-medium education maintain linguistic and cultural heritage - of family, community, region or nation. Educational reasons were typically classified into two categories - those relating to the linguistic and cognitive outcomes of Gaelic-medium education and those relating to its educational context. In all studies, these were cited as the second and third most common reason for parental choice of Gaelic-medium education respectively. Reasons relating to the outcomes of Gaelic-medium education incorporated

expressions of parental belief in the effectiveness of early immersion bilingual education, and parental awareness of the cognitive benefits of bilingualism. Reasons relating to educational context reflected parental beliefs that Gaelic-medium education has small class sizes, that it offers high-quality teaching, and that it has a parental body which engages strongly with their children's education. None of the studies reported economic factors to be key to parental choice of Gaelic-medium primary education (MacNeil, 1993; Stockdale, MacGregor and Munro 2003; O'Hanlon, McLeod and Paterson 2010).

As in Wales, there is a paucity of research in Scotland on the reasons for the choice of Celtic-medium education at the secondary school stage. An interview study of parents of Gaelic-medium pupils conducted by O'Hanlon, McLeod and Paterson (2010) reported the choice of Gaelic-medium secondary education typically to be a combination of the original reason for the choice of Gaelic-medium primary education (for example, heritage, benefits of bilingualism, quality of Gaelic-medium education) and a wish that the pupil maintain, and continue to develop, the Gaelic language skills acquired at the primary school stage. As with the analogous research in Wales (Gruffudd, Meek and Stevens 2004), the research identified the pupil as a stakeholder in decisions regarding language in education at the primary to secondary school stage, as several parents reported pupils to be involved in the decision for Gaelic-medium secondary education.

### **2.3. Research aims**

The present research aims to add to our understanding of parental choice of Celtic-medium primary education and pupil choice of Celtic-medium secondary education within Scotland and Wales, and to investigate similarities and differences in motivations for choice across the two national contexts. Three research questions are addressed:

- What factors influence parental decisions for Celtic-medium education at the primary school stage?
- What factors influence Celtic-medium primary pupils' decisions for Celtic-medium education at the secondary school stage?
- Do the patterns of response regarding choice differ between the Scottish and Welsh contexts?

## **3. Data and Methods**

### **3.1. Data**

#### **3.1.1. Sampling of schools**

The comparison of the rationales for the choice of Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium education is premised on the validity of 'home international' (Raffe et al. 1999) comparisons of nations within the UK context. Raffe et al. note:

In varying degrees, the nations of the UK have distinctive education and training systems, but all belong to the same state and share its homogenising influence. The economy and the labour market, their regulatory frameworks and their ways of working, are also relatively uniform across the UK. ... As a result, home international comparisons may provide more opportunities for theory development than the study of homogenous [education] systems with unique boundaries.

(Raffe et al. 1999, 19)

However, although the education systems of different nations are heterogeneous, the elements of the education systems being compared must be conceptually similar for 'home international comparisons' to be valid. As Øyen (1990, 3) notes: 'whatever we do in the way of cross-national comparisons must be theoretically justified – and cutting into countries theoretically is a complex process'.

In the present research, a preliminary school survey was conducted in 2007 in order to identify schools and pupils that would form the basis of such a 'home international' comparison. The preliminary survey incorporated questions on community-level, school-level and pupil-level variables, for example the council's language in education policies, whether the Celtic-medium provision was in a freestanding Celtic-medium school or a dual stream (Celtic-medium and English-medium) school, the availability of Celtic-medium subjects at the partner secondary school, and the proportion of final year primary pupils who had Welsh/Gaelic as a home language. A bilingual (Gaelic-English) questionnaire was distributed to all 62 Gaelic-medium primary education providers in Scotland, and achieved a 55% response rate - with 34 schools responding from 11 of the 14 local authority areas which provide Gaelic-medium education. A Welsh-English version of the questionnaire was distributed to 62 of the 466 Welsh-medium primary education providers in existence in 2007 (WAG 2007, 64). Schools were sampled at random from eight local authorities representing a range of community language contexts. The Welsh survey received a 26% response rate – with responses from 16 schools from 6 local authority areas. Three school-sampling categories for the main study emerged from the analysis of the variation in community, school and pupil-level variables in this preliminary survey. These categories (outlined in Table 1) enabled the 'deliberate sampling for heterogeneity' recommended by Cook and Campbell (1979, 75), and others (Gomm, Hammersley and Foster 2000; Silverman 2006).



---

<b>Table 1</b>		
<b>School categories</b>		
	<b>Community language context</b>	<b>School type</b>
<b>School Category 1</b>	Anglicized	Free-standing Welsh/Gaelic-medium school
<b>School Category 2</b>	Strongly Welsh/Gaelic speaking	Schools with bilingual policies
<b>School Category 3</b>	Bilingual – moderate levels of Welsh/Gaelic speaking	Dual stream schools

---

The school sampling process was iterative, and involved the use of the community, school and pupil variables to select comparable schools within these three school categories. Because of differences in the demographic patterns of competence in the Celtic languages in the two nations, ‘comparable’ in relation to the community language context was assessed as the density of Celtic language speakers in the community surrounding the school (as reported in the 2001 census) relative to the overall strength of Welsh and Gaelic nationally. That is to say, the study sought, for example, schools in the most strongly Welsh and Gaelic speaking communities, which resulted in the selection of schools in which 80-85% of the community spoke Welsh in Wales, and in which 60-65% of the community spoke Gaelic in Scotland (See Table 2). Welsh and Scottish schools which reported similar patterns with regard to the school and pupil variables covered in the preliminary survey were selected for the present study. 10 study schools – 4 from Wales and 6 from Scotland – were selected from the schools which had returned questionnaires. The higher number of schools in Scotland reflects the higher average number of final year primary pupils per school with Celtic-medium provision in Wales than in Scotland (Robertson 2007; WAG 2007). Bilingual requests for school participation in the research were sent to the head teachers of these ten schools and all agreed to participate. Table 2 displays the community and school characteristics of the achieved sample, by school category.

---

<b>Table 2</b>		
<b>School sample</b>		
	<b>Number of schools [Proportion of school's local community that speaks Welsh or Gaelic]<sup>2</sup></b>	
	<b>Wales</b>	<b>Scotland</b>
<b>School Category 1</b>	1 [20-25%]	1 [5%]
<b>School Category 2</b>	1 [80-85%]	2 [both 60-65%]
<b>School Category 3</b>	2 [50-55%, 15-20% respectively]	3 [35%, 3%, 0.5% respectively]

---

### *3.1.2. Sampling of respondents*

A bilingual letter was distributed to the parents of all 42 final year Gaelic-medium pupils and all 87 final year Welsh-medium pupils within the 10 study primary schools. This letter requested parents' participation in the research, and their permission that their child be invited to participate in the study. The response rate was 46% for the Welsh-medium and 55% for the Gaelic-medium sector, giving an achieved sample size of 40 Welsh-medium and 23 Gaelic-medium parent and pupil pairs. Pupils' consent to participate in the research was sought in person at their primary school. The research project was explained in Welsh or Gaelic, and priority given to the pupils making a voluntary, informed decision to participate in the research. Gallagher et al. (2010) note such an in-person oral explanation of a research project to be an example of good practice in educational research with children. Table 3 shows the distribution of pupil respondents across the three school categories outlined in Table 1.

---

<sup>2</sup> Approximate local area census figures are provided for the Scottish context in order to protect the anonymity of individual schools.

---

**Table 3****Pupil sample by school category**

Column percentages	Wales	Scotland
School Category:		
1 – Welsh/Gaelic-medium school in an anglicized urban area	30	39
2 – School with bilingual policies in a strongly Welsh/Gaelic speaking area	35	31
3 – Dual-stream school (Welsh/Gaelic-medium and English-medium) in a bilingual area	35	30

---

A Pearson's Chi-squared test for independence showed that there was no statistically significant difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupil groups in relation to their distribution across these three school categories ( $\chi^2 = 0.548$ ,  $df = 2$ ,  $p = 0.760$ ,  $n = 63$ ). The samples thus provided a suitable basis for valid comparison between the two countries in this respect.

Pupils were asked to complete a short questionnaire prior to interview. The questionnaire was available in Welsh or Gaelic and in English, and 50% of the Welsh-medium pupils and 70% of the Gaelic-medium pupils chose to complete the questionnaire in English. Table 4 presents the characteristics of the achieved pupil sample with regard to gender, first language(s), family language background, and the stage at which they started Celtic-medium education.

---

**Table 4****Pupil characteristics, by country**

Column percentages	Wales	Scotland
<b>Gender</b>		
Male	35	22
Female	65	78
<b>First Language</b>		
Welsh/Gaelic	22	9
Welsh/Gaelic and English	28	35
English	50	56
<b>Welsh/Gaelic speaker in family?</b>		
Yes	87	87
No	13	13

**Closest Celtic-language speaking relative<sup>1</sup>**

Both parents	29	20
One parent	48	45
Grandparent(s)	9	20
Sibling(s)	14	15
<b>Stage of commencement of Welsh/Gaelic-medium education</b>		
Pre-school	78	70
First year of primary school	10	13
Later	12	4

*Sample sizes: Welsh-medium pupils = 40, Gaelic-medium pupils = 23.*

<sup>1</sup> *Sample size: Welsh-medium pupils = 35, Gaelic-medium pupils = 20. The closest Celtic language speaking relative was classified in the order: parent(s), grandparent(s), siblings.*

---

Pearson's Chi-squared tests for independence showed that there was no statistically significant difference (at the 5% significance level) between the Welsh and Scottish pupil groups in relation to any of these variables.<sup>3</sup> This evidence of similarity adds to the validity of the comparison of the samples. Parents were not systematically asked for demographic information in their interviews, but 96% of the Scottish and 85% of the Welsh parental respondents were the pupils' mothers.

### **3.2.Methods**

#### **3.2.1. Methods of data collection**

Telephone interviews were conducted with parents, whilst pupil interviews took place at their primary school. The interviews began with an introduction in Welsh or Gaelic, but were subsequently conducted in English in both national contexts. My Welsh-language skills did not facilitate an in-depth interview with the Welsh respondents, and it was thus decided to conduct interviews in both contexts in English in order that the Scottish and Welsh respondents have a similar, and thus comparable, interview context. The research was conducted in accordance with the British Educational Research Association's Ethical Guidelines (2004). All pupils gave 'ongoing consent' (Flewitt 2005) for their participation in the interview, although some used an option to 'pass' for questions that they did not wish to answer. However, it is acknowledged, following Birch, Edwards and Edwards (1996), that the approach of interviewing pupils in English, rather than in their Celtic language, may have

---

<sup>3</sup> (Gender:  $\chi^2 = 1.219$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.270$ ,  $n = 63$ ; First language(s):  $\chi^2 = 1.969$ ,  $df = 2$ ,  $p = 0.374$ ,  $n = 63$ ; Gaelic/Welsh speaker in family:  $\chi^2 = 0.004$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.950$ ,  $n = 63$ ; Closest Celtic language speaking relative:  $\chi^2 = 1.712$ ,  $df = 3$ ,  $p = 0.634$ ,  $n = 63$ ; Stage of commencement of Welsh/Gaelic-medium education:  $\chi^2 = 1.189$ ,  $df = 2$ ,  $p = 0.552$ ,  $n = 63$ ).

affected respondents' engagement with, and responses to, the research. Although this is a limitation of the research, it pertained equally in Scotland and Wales, and therefore should not affect the comparability of the findings of the present research. The parental interviews focused on the rationales underpinning the choice of Welsh-medium or Gaelic-medium primary education. The pupil interviews asked pupils about their role in the decision making process regarding the language(s) of education of their secondary schooling, and the rationale(s) underpinning these decisions. Although the available provision for Celtic-medium education differed at the sample secondary schools (with pupils having between five and all secondary subjects available through the medium of Welsh or Gaelic), in all cases there was one decision to be made. Pupils could continue to the available Celtic-medium provision at the secondary school, or could opt for English-medium secondary education where Welsh or Gaelic would be available as an academic subject. In council areas with bilingual policies, the English-medium secondary education option also included the use of the Celtic language in subjects such as art, music, and personal and social education.

### *3.2.2. Methods of data analysis*

The interview data were analyzed using thematic content analysis. Spencer, Ritchie and O' Connor (2003, 200) note this process to involve the identification of themes, with a particular focus on the way in which the themes are presented by respondents, and the frequency with which they are cited. The analysis is then linked to 'outside variables' - here 'national context (Wales/Scotland)'. The first stage of the analysis enables the exploration of Research Questions 1 and 2, whilst the second stage of the analysis facilitates the exploration of Research Question 3. The process of analysis involved the inductive coding of interview data from each respondent group (Welsh-medium parents, Gaelic-medium parents, Welsh-medium pupils, Gaelic-medium pupils), and the subsequent comparison of these codes with those that had emerged from the comparator respondent group. Such a process resulted in the identification of 5 common codes (rationales) amongst the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium parental groups, and of 7 common rationales amongst the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupil groups (outlined in Section 4). Statistical analysis was used to facilitate comparisons of respondents' rationales across national context. Comparisons were made of the proportion of each respondent group who gave each rationale for the choice of Celtic-medium education, of the average number of rationales for choice expressed by each respondent group, and of patterns of independence or of co-occurrence of rationales within each respondent group. The non-parametric measures of association Phi ( $\phi$ ), Pearson's chi-square ( $\chi^2$ ) and Kendall's tau-b ( $\tau$ ) were respectively used to facilitate such comparisons (for information on non-parametric measures of association see Blalock, 1979). The key limitation

of the present research relates to sample size, as the present research formed one part of a wider study of Celtic-medium education (O’Hanlon 2012). The small sample size limits the power of statistical tests, particularly in the Scottish context.

## **4. Results**

### ***4.1. Primary school***

Four main themes arose in the content analysis as reasons for parental choice of Celtic-medium primary education: heritage, the benefits of bilingualism, the perceived quality of Celtic-medium education and employment. The category ‘heritage’ encompassed family heritage, community heritage and national heritage – and represented a wish to reflect, continue or re-claim a tradition of Celtic language and culture by means of Celtic-medium education. ‘The benefits of bilingualism’ category incorporated cognitive and personal benefits, with parents citing easier acquisition of additional languages, enhanced curricular attainment, enhanced confidence and the advantages of biculturalism. The category ‘perceived quality of Celtic-medium education’ was derived from parental beliefs that Welsh-medium or Gaelic-medium education would provide a positive pedagogical context for their child. Within this category, parents cited positive recommendations from other parents whose children were in Celtic-medium education, small class sizes (and the linked perception that this would foster high-quality learning experiences), the belief that the early immersion approach was the best way to learn a language, and the atmosphere of Celtic-medium education. The employment category included enhanced employment opportunities in both the Scottish and the Welsh contexts, and there was additionally a perception amongst several parents in the Welsh context that Welsh was, or would become, a necessary qualification for employment and social mobility, particularly following the establishment of the National Assembly for Wales in 1999. Table 5 displays the proportion of the Welsh and Scottish parental respondent groups which cited each of these rationales in the choice of Celtic-medium education.

**Table 5**

**Parental rationales for choice of Celtic-medium primary education, by country**

Percentage of respondent group citing the rationale	Wales	Scotland
<b>Heritage(*)</b>	55	78
<b>Benefits of bilingualism(*)</b>	30	52
<b>Quality of Celtic-medium education</b>	30	30
<b>Employment*</b>	28	4
<b>Other<sup>4</sup></b>	3	9

Sample sizes: Welsh-medium parents = 40, Gaelic-medium parents = 23.

\* Statistically significant difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium groups, assessed at the 5% significance level.

(\*)Statistically significant difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium groups, assessed at the 10% significance level.

Heritage:  $\phi = -0.233$ ,  $p = 0.065$ , Bilingualism:  $\phi = -0.220$ ,  $p = 0.081$ , Quality of CME:  $\phi = -0.005$ ,  $p = 0.971$ , Employment:  $\phi = 0.284$ ,  $p = 0.024$ , Other:  $\phi = -0.140$ ,  $p = 0.266$ .

*4.1.1. Results in relation to previous research in Wales and Scotland*

The results of the present research follow the broad patterns outlined in previous research in the Welsh and Scottish contexts (Table 5, Sections 2.1 & 2.2). The results of the present research additionally show no statistically significant differences from the quantitative results presented by Hodges (2012) in the Welsh context or Johnstone et al. (1999) in the Scottish context.<sup>5</sup> Such a comparison across studies was facilitated by a re-analysis of the results of each study in terms of the number of mentions of a particular rationale as a proportion of the overall number of rationales cited. In relation to the Welsh context, these proportions in the present study were (with Hodges' study results in brackets): Heritage: 38% (33%),

<sup>4</sup> The 'other' category represents two parents in Scotland and one parent in Wales. The Scottish parents each cite their child settling in a Celtic-medium pre-school (having not settled in an English-medium pre-school) as the sole rationale for the choice of Gaelic-medium education. The Welsh parent cited the earlier availability of a pre-school place in Welsh-medium than in English-medium education as the sole reason for choice.

<sup>5</sup> Comparison of the results of the present study with Hodges (2012): Heritage:  $\chi^2 = 0.466$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.495$ ,  $n$  [rationales] = 192. Educational (incorporating Benefits of bilingualism and Quality of Welsh-medium education):  $\chi^2 = 0.534$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.465$ ,  $n = 192$ . Employment:  $\chi^2 = 1.367$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.242$ ,  $n = 192$ . Other:  $\chi^2 = 0.874$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.350$ ,  $n = 192$ . Comparison of the results of the present study with Johnstone et al. (1999): Heritage:  $\chi^2 = 0.511$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.475$ ,  $n$  [rationales] = 486. Benefits of bilingualism:  $\chi^2 = 1.351$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.245$ ,  $n = 486$ . Quality of Gaelic-medium education:  $\chi^2 = 0.005$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.945$ ,  $n = 486$ . Employment:  $\chi^2 = 0.023$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.881$ ,  $n = 486$ . Other:  $\chi^2 = 0.000$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.985$ ,  $n = 486$ .

Educational factors (a category that incorporates ‘Benefits of Bilingualism’ and ‘Quality of Welsh-medium education’): 41% (36%), Employment: 19% (27%) and Other: 2% (4%) [number of rationales = 58 (134)]. In relation to the Scottish context, the patterns of response in the present study were (with Johnstone et al.’s study results in brackets): Heritage 45% (51%), Benefits of Bilingualism: 30% (23%), Quality of Gaelic-medium education: 17% (18%), Employment: 3% (3%) and Other: 5% (5%) [number of rationales = 40 (446)].

#### *4.1.2. Results in cross-national comparative perspective*

Table 5 shows employment rationales to be more frequently cited in the choice of Celtic-medium primary education by the Welsh parent group ( $\phi = 0.284$ ,  $p = 0.024$ ). This finding most likely relates to the greater institutionalization of Welsh within the public sector in Wales than Gaelic within the public sector in Scotland in the year 2000, the year in which the parental sample were making the decision for Celtic-medium primary education. In Wales, the *Welsh Language Act 1993* had required that Welsh and English be treated on the basis of equality in the public sector and in the legal system, and by 2000, Williams and Morris note both the widespread use of Welsh in the administration of public-sector bodies in Wales and the use of Welsh by some private sector companies, particularly in Cardiff (2000, 145). In contrast, no language legislation for Gaelic existed in the year 2000 and McLeod (2001, 1) notes there to have been ‘only limited inroads’ made with regard to the incorporation of the Gaelic-language in the public, voluntary and commercial sector at this time.

Table 5 also shows ‘heritage’ and ‘bilingualism’ rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium education to tend to be more frequently cited in the Scottish context ( $\phi = -0.233$ ,  $p = 0.065$ ,  $\phi = -0.220$ ,  $p = 0.081$ ). The greater frequency of citations of bilingualism rationales amongst the Scottish parents in the year 2000 likely relates to the publication of large-scale research by Johnstone et al. in 1999, which showed Gaelic-medium education to be an effective model of early immersion bilingual education. These research findings on the effectiveness of Gaelic-medium education, and the associated personal and cognitive benefits of bilingualism and biculturalism, were widely publicised by Comann nam Pàrant (The Gaelic-medium Parents’ Association), which aims to promote and support the expansion of Gaelic-medium education.

#### *4.1.3. Association of rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium primary education: cross-national comparison*

Parents in Wales and Scotland gave a similar average number of rationales per respondent for the choice of Celtic-medium primary education – 1.5 in Wales (Standard Error: 0.118), and 1.7 in Scotland (Standard Error: 0.157). However, parents of Welsh-medium pupils were



more likely to give a single reason for the choice of Celtic-medium education ( $\chi^2 = 3.48$ ,  $df = 1$ ,  $p = 0.062$ ), with 68% of the Welsh sample doing so, compared with 44% of the Scottish sample. The proportions of each parental group which gave more than one reason for the choice of Celtic-medium primary education were (with the results for Scotland in brackets): 2 rationales 23% (39%), 3 rationales: 7% (17%), 4 rationales: 2% (0%) [number of respondents: 40 (23)].

The Kendall's tau-b test was used to investigate the patterns of independence and co-occurrence of rationales within the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium parent groups. Tests explored the association of all five rationales presented in Table 5 with each of the other rationales, for example, assessing (within each country) the proportion of people who chose the heritage rationale who also chose the employment rationale. The results for the Welsh-medium parents showed the heritage rationale typically to be an independent reason for the choice of Celtic-medium education (statistically significant negative correlations were returned between heritage and each of the bilingualism, quality of Celtic-medium education and employment rationales),<sup>6</sup> and for the 'quality of Celtic-medium education' and 'employment' rationales to tend to co-occur ( $\tau = 0.330$ ,  $p = 0.039$ ). Such results broadly divide the motivations of the Welsh-medium parents in this sample into two groups, which reflect Gardner and Lambert's distinction between integrative and instrumental motivations (Gardner and Lambert 1959, 1972). The Kendall's tau-b correlation results for the Gaelic-medium parents did not show such a clear pattern. All but one of the correlations were non-significant, with the statistically significant correlation showing a negative relationship between heritage and the small number of parents who cited 'other' reasons for their choice of Celtic-medium education ( $\tau = -0.586$ ,  $p = 0.006$ ). Parents in the Scottish context thus exhibited more individual patterns of motivations for the choice of Celtic-medium education than did their Welsh counterparts.

#### **4.2. Secondary school**

98% of the final year primary Welsh-medium pupils (39 of 40) and 96% of the final year Gaelic-medium pupils (22 of 23) reported themselves to be the key stakeholder in the decision between Celtic-medium and English-medium secondary education.<sup>7</sup> Such a finding substantiates the parental reports - noted by Gruffudd, Meek and Stevens (2004) in Wales and by O'Hanlon, McLeod and Paterson (2010) in Scotland - that pupils are a key stakeholder in the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education (Sections 2.1 & 2.2). 36 of the 39 Welsh-

<sup>6</sup> Results of Kendall's tau-b tests between Heritage and (i) Bilingualism:  $\tau = -0.395$ ,  $p = 0.014$ , (ii) Quality of CME:  $\tau = -0.395$ ,  $p = 0.014$ , and (iii) Employment:  $\tau = -0.343$ ,  $p = 0.032$ .

<sup>7</sup> The two pupils who reported themselves not to be the key decision maker noted that their parents had made the choice for Celtic-medium education at secondary school.

medium pupils, and all 22 of the Gaelic-medium pupils, chose to continue with the available Celtic-medium education provision at secondary school.<sup>8</sup> Table 6 shows the rationales given by pupils for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education, and the proportion of the Welsh and Scottish pupil respondent groups which cited each rationale.

**Table 6**  
**Pupil rationales for choice of Celtic-medium secondary education, by country**

Percentage of respondent group citing the rationale	Wales	Scotland
Preference for learning in Welsh/Gaelic	53	68
Friends	39	32
Heritage	33	27
Quality of CME provider	25	27
Employment	6	14
Family language in education experiences*	44	9
Valuing of bilingualism*	3	18

*Sample sizes: Welsh-medium pupils = 36, Gaelic-medium pupils = 22.*

*\* Statistically significant difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium groups, assessed at the 5% significance level.*

*Preference CME:  $\phi = -0.152$ ,  $p = 0.248$ , Friends:  $\phi = 0.071$ ,  $p = 0.587$ , Heritage:  $\phi = 0.064$ ,  $p = 0.628$ , Quality of CME:  $\phi = -0.025$ ,  $p = 0.848$ , Employment:  $\phi = -0.140$ ,  $p = 0.287$ , Family:  $\phi = 0.371$ ,  $p = 0.005$ , Bilingualism:  $\phi = -0.266$ ,  $p = 0.043$ .*

#### *4.2.1. Results in cross-national comparative perspective*

There were no statistically significant differences in the extent to which the Gaelic-medium and Welsh-medium pupil groups cited ‘a preference for learning in Gaelic or Welsh’, ‘friends’, ‘heritage’, ‘the quality of Celtic-medium education’, or ‘employment’ in the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education. The category ‘preference for learning in Gaelic or Welsh’ encompassed pupil enjoyment of Celtic-medium primary education, perceived Celtic-language dominance (in the educational domain or more generally), and a wish to continue to develop Celtic language abilities through education. The category ‘friends’ reflected a wish to continue to be educated with friends from primary school, and the frequency with which this was cited in both national contexts substantiates Gruffudd, Meek and Steven’s (2004) report that pupils tend to make the same language in education choices as their friends at the early secondary school stage. The ‘heritage’ rationale for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education related to individual, family, community or national heritage, with pupils viewing

<sup>8</sup> The three pupils who made the choice for English-medium education did so because of (i) a lack of home-based Welsh-language homework support (ii) a perception of English-language dominance and a preference for using English and (iii) a wish to be with English-speaking friends from the local community respectively.

their choice as an expression of their identification with, or commitment to, the Welsh or Gaelic language and culture. The ‘quality of Celtic-medium education’ rationale related to a pupil perception that Celtic-medium education provided a positive learning context. Within this category, pupils mentioned both small class sizes (and the associated perception that this facilitates higher-quality learning experiences) and the reputation of the secondary school as a high-performing school. The category ‘employment’ included both pupils who were intending to have a Welsh or Gaelic related career (for example, in the media or in education) and those who felt that the ability to speak Welsh or Gaelic increased job opportunities generally. The absence of a statistical difference in the frequency with which Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupils cited employment rationales in the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education contrasts with the national difference which exists in the parental data with regard to this rationale (Section 4.1.2). The absence of a difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupil samples, as compared with the parental samples, may link to an increase in the status and institutionalization of Gaelic in employment between 2000 and 2007, the years in which parents and pupils made the decision for Gaelic-medium education respectively (Campbell et al. 2008). This period saw the passing of the *Gaelic Language (Scotland) Act 2005*, which requires Gaelic to be treated on the basis of ‘equal respect’ with English in the delivery of public services by bodies asked to prepare a Gaelic Language Plan, and also saw a campaign for the establishment of a Gaelic television channel, which was established in 2008 (Dunbar 2010).

A statistically significant difference between the two pupil groups was returned in relation to two rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education. Welsh-medium pupils more frequently cited the language in education experiences of older family members (siblings and parents) ( $\phi = 0.371$ ,  $p = 0.005$ ), and Gaelic-medium pupils more frequently cited a valuing of bilingualism ( $\phi = -0.266$ ,  $p = 0.043$ ). The difference in the frequency with which family language in education experiences were cited is likely due to the earlier establishment of Celtic-medium early immersion primary education in the Welsh context (Sections 2.1 & 2.2). The difference in relation to the frequency with which a valuing of bilingualism was cited may link to school-developed bilingualism being less common (and therefore more salient) in the Scottish than in the Welsh context. In the 2011-12 school year, 0.7% of primary pupils in Scotland were educated through Celtic-medium education, compared with 24% of pupils in Wales (Galloway 2012; Scottish Government 2012; Welsh Government 2012b).

#### *4.2.2. Association of rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education: cross-national comparison*

Pupils in Wales and Scotland both gave an average of 2.0 rationales per respondent for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education (Wales: SE: 0.141; Scotland: SE: 0.203). The proportion of each pupil group which gave one, and more than one, response for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education were (with the results for Scotland in brackets): 1 rationale: 28% (36%) 2 rationales 47% (41%), 3 rationales: 19% (14%), 4 rationales: 6% (9%) [number of respondents: 36 (22)]. There were no statistically significant differences between the pupil groups in relation to the number of reasons given for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education ( $\chi^2 = 0.960$ ,  $df = 3$ ,  $p = 0.811$ ).

The Kendall's tau-b tests of association between the pupil rationales (outlined in Table 6) returned a positive association between 'quality of Celtic-medium education' and 'family language in education experiences' ( $\tau = 0.516$ ,  $p = 0.018$ ) for the Gaelic-medium pupils. Such a co-occurrence of rationales in the Scottish context is likely due to older siblings' positive accounts of learning through Gaelic-medium education at the secondary school stage. The test results for Welsh-medium pupils showed a positive association between the 'employment' and 'quality of Celtic-medium education' rationales ( $\tau = 0.420$ ,  $p = 0.013$ ) in the choice of Welsh-medium secondary education, which mirrors the association found between these variables in the Welsh-medium parental data ( $\tau = 0.330$ ,  $p = 0.039$ , Section 4.1.3). The Welsh-medium pupil data also returned a negative correlation between heritage and preference for learning through Welsh ( $\tau = -0.393$ ,  $p = 0.020$ ), and a weaker positive association between heritage and a wish to be educated with friends from primary school ( $\tau = 0.282$ ,  $p = 0.095$ ). The negative correlation between heritage and preference for learning through Welsh indicates that heritage may be a freestanding rationale for those pupils from a Welsh-speaking family, or for those who associate with a Welsh-language cultural identity, but equally may indicate that a 'preference for learning through Welsh' is a free-standing rationale for those pupils who do not view heritage to be a factor in their choice of Welsh-medium secondary education.

## **5. Conclusion**

The paper has provided data on parental reasons for the choice of Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium primary education in the year 2000, and on pupil reasons for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education in the year 2007. The former adds to our understanding of the rationales, and the patterns of rationales, underpinning parental choice of Celtic-medium primary education in each national context (Sections 2.1 & 2.2), whilst the latter provides new understandings of the factors underpinning pupil choice of Welsh-medium and Gaelic-

medium secondary education. The mixed-methods comparative approach employed in the present study (Section 3.2) additionally enables aspects of similarity and difference between the Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium respondent groups to be investigated, with the results providing clues as to the influence of socio-cultural context on decisions for minority-medium education within these two devolved nations of the one state. The parental data returned statistically significant differences between the national contexts in relation to three of the four rationales for choice. Parents in Wales were more likely to cite employment rationales in the choice of Celtic-medium primary education in the year 2000, and parents in Scotland were more likely to cite rationales relating to heritage and to the benefits of bilingualism. The two parent groups cited rationales relating to the quality of Celtic-medium education to the same extent (Section 4.1.2). Such cross-national differences between the respondent groups were much less frequent in the pupil data: occurring in relation to two of seven rationales for choice of Celtic-medium secondary education. The Welsh-medium pupils were more likely to cite the Celtic-medium education experiences of older siblings or parents than were their Gaelic-medium counterparts – a finding which most likely reflects the earlier development of Celtic-medium education in Wales than in Scotland. Gaelic-medium pupils more frequently cited valuing of bilingualism as a reason for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education, perhaps reflecting the lower incidence, and thus greater salience, of school developed Celtic language-English bilingualism in Scotland than in Wales. The Welsh-medium and Gaelic-medium pupil groups exhibited similarity in relation to the frequency with which the remaining five rationales for the choice of Celtic-medium secondary education were expressed. These were: a preference for learning in Welsh or Gaelic, a wish to continue to be educated with friends, heritage, quality of Celtic-medium education and employment. Such comparable rationales across the Welsh and Scottish contexts indicate national language vitality not to be a key factor in pupils' language of education decisions at the primary to secondary school stage. The sampling of pupils and their parents additionally provides an opportunity to compare results across respondent-type. The instrumental rationales of 'the quality of Welsh-medium education' and 'employment' tended to co-occur in both the Welsh-medium parent and pupil groups (Section 4.2.2).

Although the research here presented aimed to inform initiatives to expand, and to promote continuity within, Celtic-medium primary and secondary education in Wales and Scotland (Section 1), the policy impact of the research may be limited by its small sample size, particularly in the Scottish context. The present study points towards the value of large-scale research into choice of Celtic-medium education in the Welsh and Scottish contexts, and offers a new mixed-methods approach for investigating the choice of minority language education in different nations of the one state.

## **Acknowledgments**

This work was supported by the Economic and Social Research Council under Grant PTA030200500042. I am grateful to the two anonymous referees, and to Professor Lindsay Paterson (School of Social and Political Science, The University of Edinburgh) for their valuable comments on an earlier draft of this article.

## References

- Baker, C. and M. Prys Jones. 2000. "Welsh Language Education: A Strategy for Revitalization." In *Language Revitalization: Policy and Planning in Wales*, edited by C.H. Williams, 116-38. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Bellin, W., S. Farrell, G. Higgs, and S. White. 1999. "The Social Context of Welsh-medium Bilingual Education in Anglicized Areas." *Journal of Sociolinguistics*. 3: 173-93.
- Birch, R., J. Edwards, and V. Edwards. 1996. "Are You Receiving Me? Conducting Interviews in Cross-cultural, Bilingual Contexts." *Multicultural Teaching*. 14:3, 13-15.
- British Educational Research Association. 2004. *Revised Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research*. London: BERA.
- Blalock, H. M. 1979 *Social Statistics*. Auckland : McGraw-Hill.
- Bòrd na Gàidhlig. 2007. *The National Plan for Gaelic 2007-2012*. Inverness: Bòrd na Gàidhlig.
- Bòrd na Gàidhlig. 2012. *National Gaelic Language Plan 2012-2017: Growth and Improvement*. Inverness: Bòrd na Gàidhlig.
- Bush, E., P. Atkinson, and M. Read. 1984. *A Minority Choice: Welsh Medium Education in an Anglicized Area – Parents' Characteristics and Motives*. Cardiff: University College Cardiff.
- Campbell, I., M. MacLeod, M. Danson and D. Chalmers. 2008. *Measuring the Gaelic Labour Market: Current and Future Potential*. Inverness: Hecla Consulting.
- Cook, T. D. and D.T. Campbell. 1979. *Quasi-Experimentation: Design and Analysis Issues for Field Settings*. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Dunbar, R. 2010. "BBC ALBA and the Evolution of Gaelic Television Broadcasting: A Case Study." *European Yearbook of Minority Issues*. 9: 389-418.
- Fishman, J. 1991. *Reversing Language Shift: Theoretical and Empirical Foundations of Assistance to Threatened Languages*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Flewitt, R. 2005. "Conducting Research with Young Children: Some Ethical Considerations". *Early Child Development and Care*, 175:6. 553-65.

Gallagher, M., S.L.Haywood, M.W.Jones, and S.Milne. 2010. "Negotiating Informed Consent with Children in School-Based research: A Critical Review." *Children and Society*. 24:6. 471-82.

Galloway, J. 2012. *Gaelic Education Data 2011-12*. Inverness: Bòrd na Gàidhlig.

Gardner, R. and W.Lambert. 1959. "Motivational Variables in Second Language Acquisition." *Canadian Journal of Psychology*. 13:4, 226-72.

Gardner, R. and W.Lambert. 1972. *Attitudes and Motivation in Second Language Learning*. Rowley, Massachusetts: Newbury House.

Gittins, C. E. 1967. *Primary Education in Wales*. London: HMSO.

Gomm, R., M. Hammersley and P. Foster. 2000. *Case study method*. London: SAGE.

Grant, J. H. 1983. "An Investigation into the Feasibility of Establishing Gaelic/English Bilingual Schools on the Mainland of Scotland." MPhil diss, The University of Glasgow.

Gruffudd, H., E. Meek and C. Stevens. 2004. *The Movement of Pupils between Welsh and Second-language Welsh*. Swansea: Llais y Lli.

Hodges, R. S. 2012. "Welsh-medium education and parental incentives – the case of the Rhymni Valley, Caerffili." *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 15: 355-73.

Johnstone, R., W. Harlen, M. MacNeil, R. Stradling and G. Thorpe. 1999. *The Attainments of Pupils Receiving Gaelic Medium Education in Scotland*. Stirling: Scottish Centre for Information on Language Teaching.

Jones, H. M. 2009. *Analysis of Census Results Pertaining to Language Transmission*. Cardiff: Welsh Language Board.

Khleif, B. B. 1980. *Language, Ethnicity and Education in Wales*. The Hague: Mouton.

MacLeod, D.J. 2003. "An Historical Overview" in *Gaelic-Medium Education*, edited by M.Nicolson and M.MacIver, 1-14. Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press.

MacNeil, M. M. 1993. *Parental Experience of Gaelic-medium Schooling*. Isle of Skye: Lèirsinn.

Marshall, J. N. and N. Alderman. 1991. "Rolling Back the Frontiers of the State: Civil Service Reorganization and Relocation in Britain." *Growth and Change*, 22(4): 51-74.

McLeod, W. 2001. *The State of the 'Gaelic Economy': A Research Report*. Edinburgh: Department of Celtic and Scottish Studies.



McPake, J., W. McLeod, F. O'Hanlon, G. Fassetta, and M. Wilson. (forthcoming)  
"Professional Development Programmes for Teachers Moving from Majority to Minoritised  
Language Medium Education: Lessons from a Comparative Study". *Language Policy*.

Morgan, I. 2003. "The Early Days of Welsh-medium Schools." In *Our Children's Language: The Welsh-medium Schools of Wales 1939-2000*, edited by I.W. Williams, 21-44. Ceredigion: Y Lolfa Cyf.

Morgan, I. W. 1969. "A Study of Parental Motivation and School and Home Interaction in the Social Milieu of a Welsh-medium School." M.Ed.diss, University of Leicester.

Office for National Statistics. 2001. *Census 2001: Report on the Welsh Language*. London: TSO.

O'Hanlon, F. 2012. "Lost in Transition? Celtic Language Revitalization in Scotland and Wales: the Primary to Secondary School Stage." PhD diss, The University of Edinburgh.

O'Hanlon, F., W. McLeod and L. Paterson. 2010. *Celtic-medium Education at the Primary and Early Secondary School Stages: Choice and Attainment*. Edinburgh: The University of Edinburgh.

Øyen, E. 1990. "The Imperfection of Comparisons" in *Comparative Methodology: Theory and Practice in International Social Research*, edited by E. Øyen, 1-18. London: SAGE.

Packer, A. and C. Campbell. 1997. *The Reasons for Parental Choice of Welsh-medium Education: a Qualitative Study of Parental Attitudes, undertaken in the Catchment Area of a Welsh-medium Primary School, in an Anglicized Area*. Aberystwyth: Undeb Cenedlaethol Athrawon Cymru.

Raffe, D., K. Brannen, L. Croxford, and C. Martin. 1999. 'Comparing England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland: the Case for 'Home Internationals' in Comparative Research.' *Comparative Education*. 35:1, 9-25.

Registrar General for Scotland. 2005. *Scotland's Census 2001: Gaelic Report*. Edinburgh: General Register Office for Scotland.

Roberts, A. 1991. "Parental Attitudes to Gaelic-medium Education in the Western Isles of Scotland." *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 12: 253-69.

Robertson, B. 2007. *Pupil Numbers in Gaelic-medium Education 2006-2007*, Glasgow: University of Strathclyde.

Scottish Government. 2012. *High Level Summary of Statistics: School Education*. <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/0042/00426161.pdf> Accessed 26.03.14.

- Silverman, D. 2006. *Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for Analysing Talk, Text and Interaction*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. London: SAGE.
- Spencer, L., J. Ritchie, and W. O'Connor. 2003. "Analysis: Practices, Principles and Processes." In *Qualitative Research Practice: a Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*, edited by J. Ritchie and J. Lewis, 199-218. London: SAGE.
- Stockdale, A., B. MacGregor and G. Munro. 2003. *Migration, Gaelic-medium Education and Language Use*. Isle of Skye: National Centre for Migration Studies.
- Weber, M. 1968. *Economy and Society: an Outline of Interpretive Sociology*. Edited by G. Roth and C. Wittich. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Welsh Assembly Government. 2003. *Iaith Pawb* [Everyone's language]: *A National Action Plan for a Bilingual Wales*. Cardiff: Welsh Assembly Government.
- Welsh Assembly Government. 2007. *Welsh in Schools 2007*. Cardiff: Welsh Assembly Government.
- Welsh Assembly Government. 2010. *Welsh-medium Education Strategy*. Cardiff: Welsh Assembly Government.
- Welsh Government. 2012a. *Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw*. [A Living Language: A Language for Living.] *Welsh Language Strategy 2012-17*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Welsh Government. 2012b. *School Statistics Compendium 2012*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Williams, G., E. Roberts and R. Isaac. 1978. "Language and Aspirations for Upward Social Mobility." In *Social and Cultural Change in Contemporary Wales*, edited by G. Williams, 193-205. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Williams, G. and D. Morris. 2000. *Language Planning and Language Use: Welsh in a Global Age*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Williams, R. H. and J. Reynolds. 2003. "Background: the Union of Welsh-medium School Parents." In *Our Children's Language: The Welsh-medium Schools of Wales, 1939-2000*, ed. I. W. Williams, 362-67. Talybont (Wales): Y Lolfa.